Automatic Deposits for All at Birth: Maine’s Harold Alfond College Challenge

By Margaret Clancy and Michael Sherraden

“We’ve come to realize that providing the opportunity to receive the [College Challenge] grant isn’t enough. We need to make sure that all Maine babies actually receive the grant.”

~Gregory Powell, Chairman of the Harold Alfond Foundation

Child Development Accounts (CDAs), opened as early as birth, promote saving and asset accumulation for postsecondary education and other developmental purposes. Ideally, CDA programs include all children, with progressive funding for those most disadvantaged (Sherraden, 1991; Beverly, Elliott, & Sherraden, 2013).

The first statewide CDA in the United States—Maine’s Harold Alfond College Challenge—has announced a major change in strategy to automatically enroll all newborns as a way to “raise aspirations for and improve access to higher education for Maine’s young people” (Harold Alfond Foundation [HAF], 2013, p. 3). Evidence from CDA research has contributed to the decision by the College Challenge to remove its original opt-in requirement—in which parents must enroll their newborns in the state’s 529 college savings plan to receive a $500 grant—in favor of universal enrollment—in which every child is enrolled automatically at birth with a $500 grant: “Specifically, research conducted by experts at the Center for Social Development at Washington University in St. Louis has suggested that, if universal enrollment is the College Challenge’s policy goal, an ‘opt in’ strategy may not do the job....the Center has raised serious questions about [the] program’s underlying ‘opt-in’ structure while reinforcing its overarching mission” of providing “every Maine baby with a college account” (HAF, 2012, pp. 5, 4).

From 2008 to 2013, the College Challenge invested approximately $11.5 million on behalf of nearly 23,000 Maine babies. As of 2013, about 40% of eligible children had been enrolled and received the $500 grant. Despite extensive marketing and outreach efforts by the Alfond Scholarship Foundation (ASF)¹ and the Finance Authority of Maine (FAME),² some parents may have been deterred by a two-step enrollment process and a complicated 529 college savings plan application (Clancy & Lassar, 2010). Research indicates that parents in Maine with more education, other investments, and a financial advisor were more likely than those who were less financially sophisticated to enroll their children in the College Challenge. It may be that enrolled children’s parents better understood the program rules, benefits, and application process (Huang, Beverly, Clancy, Lassar, & Sherraden, 2013). The likely result is that “those not participating are from families who would benefit most” (HAF, 2012, p. 5).
Universal and Automatic Deposits at Birth

With universal enrollment, the ASF automatically deposits $500 for each Maine resident newborn into a single 501(c)(3) scholarship account (ASF account). Using birth record information that they receive monthly from the Maine Bureau of Vital Records within the Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS), FAME tracks the account value for each newborn (Figure 1). Parents do not need to opt in (but may opt out) of the College Challenge (Table 1).³

The College Challenge expects that about 62,500 Maine children (12,500 annually) will receive approximately $31,250,000 ($6,250,000 annually) over the next five years (Figure 3). Recipients can use College Challenge funds—including the initial $500 grant plus earnings—and any family contributions and NextGen Matching Grants for qualified higher education expenses at in-state and out-of-state four-year colleges, community colleges, vocational schools, and other postsecondary institutions. The NextGen 529 structure will allow for transfer of funds directly to qualified higher education institutions (see Figure 1).

---

Figure 1. Automatic Enrollment and Communications in the College Challenge

- FAME obtains monthly birth records from the Maine DHHS.
- ASF \textit{automatically deposits a $500 grant} for every resident newborn into the ASF account and notifies parents \textit{when the child is about one month old}.
- ASF and FAME send \textit{Quarterly Summaries to all parents}. Summaries include college savings balances and age-appropriate tips and activities.
- Parents receive information about opening an account and saving in the NextGen 529 \textit{when the child is approximately one year old}.
- Parents open a NextGen 529 account and save for the child’s postsecondary education.
- Parents are eligible for Maine’s NextStep Matching Grant.
- Parents view college savings balances on \textit{one} quarterly NextGen 529 statement.
- \textit{Youth use savings for postsecondary education. Funds will be sent directly to qualified higher education institutions.}
- Parents may opt out of receiving communications from the College Challenge by contacting FAME.
- Parents do not open a NextGen 529 account.
- \textit{Youth use savings for postsecondary education. Funds will be sent directly to qualified higher education institutions.}
Table 1. College Challenge Opt-In versus Opt-Out Enrollment and Communications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents(^1) had to open a Maine NextGen 529 account before the child’s first birthday to receive the $500 grant.</td>
<td>College Challenge automatically enrolls Maine resident children at birth and deposits $500 into the ASF account.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Application                  | Parents completed a short form available at hospitals, doctors’ offices, and libraries and online to obtain an enrollment kit.\(^5\)  
Parents were required to complete a NextGen 529 application to receive the $500 grant. | Parents are not required to take any action. |

| Financial and educational communications | All parents received information about opening an account and making contributions in their own NextGen 529 account.  
Communications specific to the College Challenge (i.e., explaining that no initial contribution was required, etc.) supplemented the NextGen 529 materials.\(^6\) | The College Challenge notifies all parents of the $500 grant when the child is about one month old.  
All parents will receive information about opening and contributing to their own NextGen 529 account when the child is approximately one year old. |

| Parents who opened their own NextGen 529 account received Quarterly Summaries with college savings balances—which include the College Challenge grant, family contributions, NextGen Matching Grants, and earnings—and age-appropriate tips and activities (Figure 2). | All parents\(^5\) receive Quarterly Summaries (see Figure 2) with college savings balances—which include the College Challenge grant, family contributions, NextGen Matching Grants, and earnings\(^c\)—and age-appropriate tips and activities.\(^d\) |

| Parents who opened their own NextGen account viewed their child’s college savings balance—including the College Challenge grant, family contributions, NextGen Matching Grants, and earnings on one quarterly NextGen statement delivered by the 529 program manager. | Same |

---

\(^a\) A 2008 pilot program was open to infants born at two hospitals in Maine. The first year of statewide program eligibility was 2009.

\(^1\) All parents, not only those who open a NextGen 529 account within the children’s first year, receive Quarterly Summaries (see Figure 2).

\(^2\) The Quarterly Summary will reflect zero values for contributions and matching grants (see Figure 2) if the family has not opened an account and saved for the child. The phrase “family contributions” refers to deposits from any individuals, including the child’s family members and others.

\(^3\) Tips and activities vary quarterly and include topics such as reading, science, math, health, and finances. As College Challenge babies mature, regularly distributed educational materials will be appropriate for older children and their families. See [http://www.500forbaby.org/Files/Pages/parent_resources.aspx](http://www.500forbaby.org/Files/Pages/parent_resources.aspx).
**Figure 2. Sample Quarterly Summary**

![Harold Alfond College Challenge Logo](image)

**TIPS for Isaac**

A. Get Ready to Read!
B. On the “Write” Path to Reading
C. Take Isaac to the Library

**RESOURCES:** 500forbaby.org/resources

---

**Account Owner:**
Susan Sample
123 Main Street
Anywhere, ME 55555-5555

**NextGen College Investing Plan**
Account Number Ending In: 555
Quarterly Summary for
Account Beneficiary:
Isaac A. Sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Oct-Dec 2013</th>
<th>As of 12/31/13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Total Account Activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfond Grant</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contributions</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NextGen Matching Grants</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

See reverse side for important information and how to read the Quarterly Summary.

**QUESTIONS? CALL FAME 1-800-228-3734**

---

**TIPS for Isaac**

A. **Get Ready to Read!** Research shows that children whose parents read to them have an easier time learning to read. Read Isaac fun and lively stories every day and encourage playing with books.

B. **On the “Write” Path to Reading.** Leave “I love you” or “see you when you get home” notes in a lunchbox, or have Isaac hold the grocery list while you shop to practice reading.

C. **Take Isaac to the Library.** Get into a routine of taking Isaac to the library for story time and to check out books. The librarian will also likely have recommendations.

For more tips and resources, visit 500forbaby.org/resources

**LITERACY**

3–5 Years

---

**Invest in Isaac’s Dreams!**

**CONTRIBUTION COUPON**

**Account Number Ending In: 555**

**Account Owner’s Last Name:** SAMPLE

**Account Owner’s First Name:** SUSAN

**Isaac A. Sample**

NextGen Account Beneficiary/Student Name

**Contributions by check:**
Enclose a check payable to:
NextGen FBO (Beneficiary/Student Name)

**Deposit Total:** $ __________

If the individual making a contribution is not the account owner, refer to the reverse side for more information regarding third party contributions.

*Please review “IMPORTANT INFORMATION” on the reverse side prior to making a contribution.*

---

*This figure illustrates a sample Quarterly Summary for a child whose family has opened a NextGen 529 account. If a NextGen 529 account has not been opened, the summary will report the value of the $500 grant only, and the contribution coupon will be replaced with information about opening a NextGen 529 account.*
As in the previous opt-in strategy, the $500 grants are deposited into the ASF account on behalf of the children and invested in a restricted portfolio within the NextGen College Investing Plan® (NextGen 529). This unique structure ensures that College Challenge funds are used only for qualified educational purposes and kept separate from money contributed by families who open their own NextGen 529 accounts. A key feature of this structure is that the 529 program manager reports College Challenge funds, family contributions, NextGen Matching Grants, and earnings are reported on one quarterly NextGen statement.

Family contributions to NextGen 529 accounts are eligible for NextStep Matching Grants—50% matches—up to $100 per year with a lifetime maximum amount of $1,000, regardless of family income. In 2011, NextGen eliminated household income thresholds for the savings match. This policy change eliminated the annual match application and savers’ self-certification of adjusted gross income. Thus, if certain rules are met, NextStep Matching Grants are deposited automatically.

College Challenge resources that had been used under the opt-in strategy to enroll children may now focus on encouraging family contributions, developing educational communications aimed at increasing children’s and families’ aspirations, boosting parental engagement, and improving college readiness. Figure 4 estimates the allocation of operational resources under the opt-in and opt-out strategies for the College Challenge.

Universal and Automatic CDAs

Automatic enrollment in the College Challenge ensures that every Maine resident newborn will receive a $500 grant for postsecondary education. This universal participation matters because every child—including disadvantaged children who may gain the most—will have the opportunity to benefit from having a CDA. Universal and automatic CDAs also foster a culture of saving for education among all families with children and encourage creative funding flows. For example, when all children participate, teachers can incorporate CDAs into classroom lessons in math and financial planning, and businesses might offer matching contributions or benchmark incentives to children in local schools to increase savings.
There are several reasons to expect that CDAs improve educational outcomes for youth. Some researchers propose that CDAs may increase college success by raising the educational expectations of parents and children and helping families be financially prepared for college. Specifically, CDAs may bring about these changes by:

1. communicating to parents and children that college is important and expected,
2. communicating to parents and children that planning and saving for college are important,
3. providing a place to deposit money when families are motivated and able to save for college,
4. providing assets for college, and
5. increasing parents’ and children’s financial capability (see Beverly et al., 2013, pp. 4-5).

Notably, researchers suggest that CDAs may influence college success whether or not families open their own college savings accounts and save some of their own money for college. In other words, automatic enrollment and deposits alone may trigger some of the positive changes expected to improve educational outcomes.

The $500 grant in the College Challenge is important because it is an investment in the future education of children. Without CDAs, advantaged families are much more likely than disadvantaged families to have money set aside for college (Beverly, Kim, Sherraden, Nam, & Clancy, 2012). When parents know that someone—especially someone outside the family—has invested in their children's future, they may be more hopeful (Gray et al., 2012), which may change their attitudes and behavior during the childhood years. Positive parental attitudes and behaviors may affect the child in numerous positive ways.

Communication is another important component of the College Challenge (see Table 1 and Figure 4). Quarterly Summaries (see Figure 2) remind parents and children about the importance of a college education, the importance of saving for college, and that children have college savings. It is noteworthy that the opt-out strategy in Maine provides Quarterly Summaries to all birth mothers—not only those who open a NextGen 529 account within the child’s first year (see Table 1).

The following is a quote from a study participant whose daughter received a CDA as part of SEED for Oklahoma Kids (SEED OK), a research and policy experiment to invest in all children at birth. It highlights the value of initial deposits and quarterly 529 statements:

"I think it’s very important for her future. Cause I think that if she continues to see these [statements] come in then, that people beside me and her dad, you know, and family—but people out there that she has no idea about—want to give her money to go to school, then it must be darn important to go to school...I’ll be like, “this is your mail, you know, and this is ’cause you got this money when you were born,” and I think that it will be just an encouraging story." (Sherraden et al., 2013, p. 74)
Automatically opened CDAs with an initial deposit may have particularly strong effects for disadvantaged children. Children in middle- and upper income families may grow up knowing that they will go to college whether or not they have CDAs. In contrast, low-income parents may believe that college is unaffordable, and this belief could influence children's educational expectations. However, “CDAs may change this dynamic in low-income families, allowing parents and children to see college as a possibility” (Beverly et al., 2013, p. 6).

SEED OK, which automatically opened and deposited $1,000 in an Oklahoma College Savings Plan account for 1,360 children born in 2007, increased disadvantaged young children's social-emotional development at age four. The impact is larger in families that have low education and low income, receive welfare benefits, and rent their homes. Further analysis shows that children's development is affected positively by SEED OK, regardless of whether parents have saved (Huang et al., 2014). In other words, it may be holding an account and having assets for college—not saving behavior of parents—that matter for child development.

**Key Partnerships with Agencies and Community**

In addition to state partnerships with FAME, NextGen, and the Maine DHHS, the College Challenge has engaged business, foundation, education, and other community partners. These partners provide support—and sometimes offer matching contributions—to encourage opening of and saving in parent-owned NextGen 529 accounts. A number of organizations have made specific commitments, and additional partnerships are in the planning stages. Table 2 provides examples of newly created or existing partnerships. As noted in Figure 4, with universal enrollment, the College Challenge can use more operational resources to encourage family contributions and increase educational information in 2014 and beyond.

**Table 2. College Challenge Partnerships**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>General description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Businesses</td>
<td>Businesses raise awareness of the College Challenge among their employees, promote payroll deduction, and—in some cases—provide corporate matching contributions to parents who open a NextGen 529 account (usually by the child’s first birthday). FAME can provide on-site Lunch &amp; Learn NextGen application assistance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundations and other nonprofit organizations</td>
<td>Foundations leverage existing programs (Head Start and Volunteer Income Tax Assistance [VITA]) to encourage family contributions and promote educational communications. For example, nonprofit organizations that serve as VITA sites, where low-income families can get help completing tax returns and claiming their Earned Income Tax Credit, work with FAME to encourage families to open NextGen 529 accounts and deposit a portion of their tax refunds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education experts</td>
<td>Education experts provide advice on the development of educational communications. The College Challenge shares information with parents about the importance of reading at home, participating in parent-teacher conferences, asking about homework, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Context and Potential
Going Forward

The concept of universal asset building for child development and lifelong financial security was introduced in the United States in *Assets and the Poor* (Sherraden, 1991), which suggested the use of universal and progressive accounts beginning as early as birth. Since that book’s publication, policy discussions have become widespread, the benefits of asset building are broadly accepted, many applications of asset-building policies have been initiated, research has built a body of knowledge on potential positive impacts, and a new generation of policy researchers has taken up this area of inquiry. The stage has been set for Maine’s College Challenge, the first statewide asset-building policy in the United States to include universal and automatic accounts at birth.

The United States is fortunate to have a vibrant philanthropic community that, at its best, plays a leadership role in initiating new ideas that are later taken up by others. Although it uses philanthropic resources, the College Challenge is modeling public policy. Many nations use public funds for monthly child allowance payments or child savings accounts (Curley & Sherraden, 2000; Loke & Sherraden, 2009). In this comparative context, the United States has underinvested in its children, and universal CDAs are a productive way to reinvest.

Maine’s College Challenge serves as a model for other state 529 college savings plans and also will inform policy discussions and proposals at the national level.

Because successful implementation of universal and automatic accounts and deposits requires a savings plan structure, the existing 529 policy platform in the states plays an important role. The policy platform for universal and progressive CDAs does not have to be built because it is already in place. The 529 infrastructure is an “underutilized public good waiting to be designed to serve all families in America” (Sherraden, 2009).

If inclusion is a guiding principle in public policy, no model could be more appropriate than Maine’s College Challenge. Existing 529 plans across the United States predominantly serve advantaged families who receive public subsidies through tax benefits (Clancy, 2001; General Accounting Office, 2012; U.S. Department of the Treasury, 2009). This policy—like other tax subsidies for asset building in home ownership and through 401(k) plans—is highly regressive (i.e., most of the benefits go to the wealthiest). As such, these existing policies are an ineffective use of public resources.

If public subsidies are to be used for building assets—including education, homes, retirement accounts, and others—funds should be distributed among all Americans. Nowhere is the discrepancy in inclusion more apparent or more harmful than in rates of educational attainment. For all of these reasons, the 529 structure is a promising platform to establish a new policy principle of inclusion in asset building (Clancy, 2001; Clancy, Orszag, & Sherraden, 2004; Sherraden, 2009). Maine’s College Challenge may lead not only to state 529 innovations for greater financial inclusion and educational attainment but also to broader policy considerations. The College Challenge puts squarely on the table the good governance principle of inclusion in asset building, and this can only be positive.

Endnotes

1. The nonprofit Alfond Scholarship Foundation (ASF) manages the College Challenge. The Harold Alfond Foundation is a private foundation that provides funding for ASF and the College Challenge to fulfill Harold Alfond’s vision that “every child in the 21st century should have aspirations and access to higher education.”
2. The College Challenge is administered for the Alfond Scholarship Foundation by the Finance Authority of Maine (FAME). The NextGen College Investing Plan® is administered by FAME.

3. Children will automatically become eligible to receive the College Challenge grant if named on the birth records. There will be potentially eligible children for whom the process will not be automatic. These include, for example, Maine resident newborns who were born out of state and babies who become Maine residents by adoption. These children will have to prove Maine residency at birth in order to receive the grant. This will also include children who are not Maine residents at birth but who move to Maine as babies. Of the 1,361 treatment participants in the SEED OK study, one mother declined the automatic account with $1,000 initial deposit for her child for religious reasons (see Zager, R., Kim, Y., Nam, Y., Clancy, M., & Sherraden, M. (2010). *The SEED for Oklahoma Kids Experiment: Initial account opening and savings* (CSD Research Report 10-41). St. Louis, MO: Washington University, Center for Social Development.

4. Parents generally enroll a child; however, anyone 18 years or older, regardless of residency, may open a NextGen account on behalf of a Maine resident newborn.

5. This step was eliminated for online applicants in March 2011.

6. For lump-sum contributions before July 2013, the minimum initial required contribution for NextGen direct-sold and broker-sold 529 plans was $250. College Challenge materials, which notified parents that the minimum deposit was not required, supplemented the NextGen application. NextGen’s current minimum initial contributions are $25 for the direct-sold plan and $250 for the broker-sold plan.

7. For the opt-out strategy, the children’s Social Security numbers are not needed at birth to designate the $500 grants since they are deposited into ASF account. Internal Revenue Code 26 USC § 529(e) views “entity scholarship accounts” as either an account without designated beneficiaries or an account with a specific beneficiary. Such accounts do not need to have a specific individual designated as the beneficiary when the account is established. The entity may designate the beneficiary at the time the scholarship is awarded.

8. An ideal CDA program would automatically open a *single account* to hold public, private, and family contributions.

9. Although College Challenge grant funds appear on NextGen account statements and Quarterly Summaries, ASF retains ownership of all College Challenge funds, and FAME retains ownership of NextGen Matching Grants, including any earnings, until they are used for qualified higher education expenses.

10. To participate in a 529 savings match program, most states require the account owner to complete a match application and sometimes mail copies of tax returns (state, federal, or both) each year to prove income eligibility. Louisiana and Maine are the only states that do not require such paperwork. Louisiana uses state Department of Revenue tax records to automatically calculate and deposit the annual match on contributions to the state’s 529 START Saving Program. On the state’s 529 application, prospective account owners authorize the Louisiana Tuition Trust Authority to access and use state income tax information to verify federal adjusted gross income to determine eligibility. Louisiana’s savings match program is also progressive (i.e., higher match rates go to those with lower household incomes) although all state residents, regardless of income, are eligible to receive at least the minimum match rate (Lassar, Clancy, & McClure, 2011).

11. The NextStep Matching Grant is deposited automatically in the first NextGen 529 account opened per beneficiary (if either the account owner or beneficiary is a Maine resident) for contributions of at least $50 in a calendar year. See [http://www.famemaine.com/files/Pages/NextGen/Nextstep_Matching_Grant.aspx](http://www.famemaine.com/files/Pages/NextGen/Nextstep_Matching_Grant.aspx).

12. Citing research findings by the Center for Social Development, Nevada Treasurer Kate Marshall launched the College Kick Start as a pilot program in 2013. The initiative automatically established a 529 college savings account with $50 for about 3,400 kindergarten students in 13 rural communities. Statewide expansion of the program announced February 4, 2014, includes nearly 35,000 kindergarten students (see [http://collegekickstart.nv.gov/](http://collegekickstart.nv.gov/)). In his February 6, 2014, State of the State Address, Connecticut Governor Malloy proposed college savings accounts for every child born or adopted in the state. The proposal includes a deposit of $100 into state 529 accounts (Connecticut Higher Education Trust [CHET]). The state also proposes that if parents save $150 in the first
four years, they will provide a $150 savings match. Governor Malloy’s State of the State remarks can be found at http://www.governor.ct.gov/malloy/cwp/view.asp?A=11&Q=539440.


References


Acknowledgments

Support for this report comes from the Citi Foundation. Other funders of research on college savings include the Ford Foundation, Charles Stewart Mott Foundation, and Lumina Foundation for Education. The authors thank Gregory Powell, Chairman of the Harold Alfond Foundation, and Colleen Quint, President and CEO at the Alfond Scholarship Foundation, for information on the history of and future plans for the College Challenge. Elizabeth Vanderweide, Director of Business Development and Customer Relations at the Finance Authority of Maine, shared College Challenge program and NextGen 529 administration functions. At the Center for Social Development, Sandy Beverly and Jin Huang reviewed the report and offered helpful suggestions, Tiffany Trautwein edited and formatted the report, and Katie Stalter designed the figures.

Suggested citation