Overview of Child Development
Accounts in Developing Countries

Jeff Meyer
School of Advanced International Studies
Johns Hopkins University

Rainier D. Masa
Center for Social Development

Jamie M. Zimmerman
New America Foundation

2009

CSD Working Papers
No. 09-55
Overview of Child Development Accounts in Developing Countries

Child Development Accounts (CDAs) as a matter of policy have existed for some time, though predominantly in developed countries. While there are at least a few government social programs with CDA components in the developing world, such policies have yet to gain significant traction. This paper finds that despite this lack of policy movement, CDAs do exist in developing countries in a variety of forms and delivered by a diverse group of institutions. Government-linked institutions (such as savings and post banks); non-governmental institutions (such as credit unions and NGOs); and commercial financial institutions are all innovating in CDA design and delivery. This paper offers a review of how CDAs exist in developing countries, including the types of institutions offering CDAs, and design features and delivery mechanisms common among such accounts. The paper concludes with implications of this analysis for policymakers and researchers.

Key words: Child Development Accounts, developing countries, child savings, policy design

Introduction

The subject of CDAs in the developing world has received relatively little scholarly attention. This, in large part, is because CDAs have traditionally been a conception of social policy makers and scholars in developed countries. In fact, to date, no CDA policy exists in developing countries that fits with the traditional policy model of comprehensive government CDA policies in places such as the United Kingdom, Singapore, and South Korea, or those advocated in the United States. Social policymakers in developing countries face more challenges in launching CDA policies than their counterparts in developed countries. These challenges include scarcer resources for competing social priorities and poorer banking infrastructures.

However, CDAs do exist in developing countries. Policy and product innovations on CDAs have emerged in a variety of forms in developing countries offered by diverse institutions, including (a) governments, as a component of social assistance programs; (b) non-governmental groups including credit unions, MFIs, NGOs, and social policy researchers; (c) government-run banks; and, to a lesser extent, (d) commercial financial institutions.

At its most basic level, this paper presents evidence of the existence of CDAs by reviewing several different types of such accounts in operation in developing nations. However, to do so we used a broader definitional view of CDAs than is common in the CDA field. In this paper, we conceive of

---

The authors would like to thank the anonymous reviewers of an outline and draft of this paper. We are indebted to Michael Sherraden, Director of the Center for Social Development at Washington University in St. Louis, and Ray Boshara, Director of the Asset Building Program at the New America Foundation, who provided us guidance and much of the framework underlying this paper.

1 For an overview of comprehensive government CDA policies, see Loke & Sherraden, 2008.
CDAs as *saving policies, programs, or products for children with features or delivery mechanisms that have the potential to contribute to a child’s social and/or economic development.*

This paper provides an overview of the breadth of CDAs in operation in the developing world. More specifically, it analyzes the variety of innovative design features and delivery mechanisms of CDAs as offered by a diverse range of institutions. It also addresses a number of policy and scholarship implications of our study and analysis. For example, the study of current trends in developing country CDAs could provide useful lessons to (a) developing country policymakers interested in leveraging existing CDA platforms for more broad-based CDA policies; (b) developed countries policymakers considering new design or delivery pathways to improve the impact of their CDA policies, and; (c) social policy researchers aiming to deepen scholarship on the design and impact of CDAs.

This paper proceeds as follows: this first section goes on to explain the methodology and limitations of our research, and offers a brief note of historical context of CDAs in developing countries. The main section offers a typology of the types of institutions offering CDAs in the developing world, and analyzes a number of innovative design features and delivery mechanisms of CDAs in developing countries. The final section offers (limited) data on uptake of CDAs in developing countries, and implications of our analysis for policymakers and social policy researchers. The appendix offers a chart comparing the features of several CDAs from various regions of the world.

**Methodology and limitations**

This paper provides an analytic overview of current trends in CDAs in developing countries. Data presented and analyzed in this paper were collected primarily through an extensive literature review as well as interviews with a number of institutions that offer CDAs. The paper is not designed to give an exhaustive list of all CDA features and delivery mechanisms, but to highlight some features and mechanisms that have the potential to contribute to a child’s development. Lack of scholarly research on CDAs in developing countries limits the selection of programs and products with supporting empirical evaluation as few impact evaluations or studies exist. The programs included in the paper were selected, at the very least, by determining whether or not such programs fit the paper’s conception of CDAs, i.e. those accounts for children that have features or delivery mechanisms that have the potential to contribute to a child’s development. We excluded from our discussion savings products or programs that we believe do not fit this conception. This rationale avoided indiscriminate selection of savings accounts for children, which, viewed simply as a savings account offered to children, may exist in every developing country.

**Historical context of CDAs in developing countries**

Savings accounts targeted at, or at least available to, children are not a new phenomenon in the developing world. During the 1960s, 1970s, and 1980s, governments in the developing world created networks of state-owned or state-subsidized savings and retail banks as part of an effort to mobilize deposits from the “mass” population, particularly in rural areas (Young & Vogel, 2005). While this effort increased access to savings account for low-income clients and their children, the

---

2 The bulk of these interviews were carried out in the second half of 2007 and data from these interviews were previously presented in Meyer et al., 2008.
institutions themselves were often plagued by poor management and political interference. Numerous failures and bailouts in the 1970s and 1980s led to pressure from the World Bank and IMF, and fiscal pressures from within governments to privatize, liquidate or sell these banks (Young & Vogel, 2005). Such restructuring led to many banks falling out of favor with clients, and many savings accounts ended up dormant. Banks in time reacted to these pressures by closing dormant accounts and de-emphasizing products/programs that were not efficient or sustainable. While there has been resurgence in savings and retail banks in recent years with the expansion of the microfinance movement and bottom of the pyramid (BOP) market outreach, only a small number of these have successfully created child-focused savings products that have led to substantial deposit mobilization among low-income families (WSBI, 2004).

At the same time, savings accounts have been available to children in middle-income urban populations in developing countries for many decades. However, these products often have few features that set them apart from the standard savings accounts offered by the banks. These products are usually controlled by parents and are considered part of the family’s portfolio, rather than children’s property. More importantly, these CDAs are usually not targeted at poor children.

Our research provides evidence that CDAs do exist in the developing world, and that in recent years, a number of institutions have introduced, or announced plans for, innovative accounts for children. In the next section, we examine the types of institutions offering CDAs and their objectives for offering such accounts; and then go on to survey the variety of account features and delivery mechanisms.

**Survey of CDAs in Developing Countries**

The experience of institutions in the developing world with CDAs is broad and varied. This section examines a typology of CDAs in developing countries, including the types of institutions offering CDAs; their objectives for doing so; some innovative design features; and delivery mechanisms employed to facilitate their uptake. As the discussion below indicates, there is no universal CDA model, and the design of CDAs is closely linked to the objectives of the institutions offering them.

**Typology of CDAs in developing countries**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutions</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Delivery Mechanisms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local and/or National Governments</td>
<td>Financial (cultivate clients, increase profits, mobilize resources from savings)</td>
<td>Low Minimum Initial Deposit Requirement</td>
<td>Operating Deposit Centers at Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-governmental Institutions</td>
<td>Social (reduce poverty, increase equity)</td>
<td>Modest In-Kind and Financial Incentives</td>
<td>Remote Deposit Collection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State-Owned Financial Institutions</td>
<td>Blended (CSR, financial inclusion, financial literacy, any mix of the above)</td>
<td>Significant Financial Incentives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial Financial Institutions</td>
<td></td>
<td>Withdrawal Restrictions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ability of Children to Control Accounts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Institutions offering CDAs and their objectives for offering CDAs

Currently, a diverse range of institutions is offering a variety of CDAs across the developing world. These include local and national governments, non-governmental institutions, state-owned FIs, and commercial FIs. These institutions design CDAs to meet one or more particular economic and/or social objectives, which are most often closely linked to their respective institutional missions. These objectives can range from purely financial (i.e. earning profits for shareholders) to purely social (i.e. reducing poverty in areas in which they operate). However, often we observe a blend of the two.

Local and/or national governments. There are relatively few examples of governments offering CDAs as part of a structured social policy. Where they do exist, such as in Mexico and Senegal, they are generally designed to spur financial inclusion, reduce poverty, and increase economic equity.

Non-governmental institutions. NGOs tend to offer CDAs as a strategy to improve socioeconomic development of poor children and their families. They are generally less motivated by financial objectives, though a number of non-governmental MFI s may consider deposit mobilization as a mean to financially sustain their organizations. NGOs may see fostering a habit of savings as a strategy to help children accumulate assets necessary to live productive adult lives. Others see offering CDAs held at formal FIs as giving children physical evidence (i.e. in the form of an account passbook) of their identity, which can offer a link to the financial and economic mainstream. A majority of NGOs offering CDAs also incorporate financial literacy into their programs and products. Building financial literacy from a young age can be important because it can create savvy consumers of financial products, such as microloans. While some institutions offer financial education and training as a component of their overall CDA offering, others believe that the presence of a CDA itself can contribute to financial literacy. They contend that having ownership of and making deposits in savings accounts can help a child learn financial skills such as budgeting, understanding the power of compound interest, and learning how banks work.

State-owned financial institutions. State-owned financial institutions, such as savings and post banks, often operate under a mandate of financial inclusion of the poor and/or financially excluded. These institutions view fostering financial literacy, as well as a habit and/or culture of savings among children as a key element of their institutional mission. Thus, many state-owned FIs are offering CDAs in order to fulfill their mandate, while simultaneously seeking increased share of the unbanked market. In this sense, such institutions offer CDAs to meet a blend of social and financial objectives.

---

3 For an introduction to, or further reading on, CDAs in developing countries, see Meyer, et. al., 2008.
4 CSR, as defined by the International Finance Corporation, is “the commitment of businesses to contribute to sustainable economic development by working with employees, their families, the local community and society at large to improve their lives in ways that are good for business and for development” (International Finance Corporation, n.d.).
5 Institutions may also see CDAs as a channel to integrate parents and other family members of the child account holders in the banking system (i.e. when a relative visits a bank to make a deposit in the child’s account, the bank has an opportunity to encourage the adult to open an account of their own).
6 A study on mobilizing savings among the urban poor in Pakistan found that participants “do not have a great deal of knowledge about banks and the services they offer, and see their own limited education as a barrier to understanding and using banks” (Burki & Mohammed, 2008). The study adds, “Banks are seen by the urban poor to be intimidating” (Burki & Mohammed, 2008).
Commercial financial institutions. There are at least a few commercial financial institutions that consider their financial inclusion efforts (including offering CDAs to poor and/or vulnerable children) as their corporate social responsibility (CSR). At the same time, promoting a habit of savings can be good business for banks, as it can translate into a stream of regular deposits and a long-term relationship with clients. Some commercial FIs see offering CDAs as a way to cultivate “life-long” customers that will be loyal to their businesses, as they grow older. In some cases, FIs build financial literacy training or experience-building into the product offering for such a reason.

CDA features

Institutions design CDA products and programs so that they are aligned with their respective strategies and missions. Institutions can select from a variety of features: from low-cost to high-cost; and from those that offer child accountholders modest help, to those that offer them significant help. CDA features include: low minimum initial deposit requirements; modest in-kind and financial incentives; significant financial incentives; withdrawal restrictions; and the ability of children to control accounts. Indeed, an institution may incorporate a number of these features (as well as others) into the CDAs that they offer. Needless to say, this list of features is illustrative, not exhaustive, as there is ample room to vary and innovate in the design of such products. Some possible features of CDAs and their potentials to contribute to the economic and/or social development of children are explored below.

Low minimum initial deposit. A low minimum initial deposit is among the most common feature of CDAs surveyed in this study. This feature makes it easier for a child or their parents to open a CDA. Although this feature may not directly result in improved child well-being, CDAs that have low minimum initial deposit have the potential to provide a greater number of children and their families a secure and guaranteed place for their savings. This feature makes CDAs affordable and may encourage families, especially those who have irregular and low income, to opt to use bank accounts rather than informal and insecure forms of saving. Compared to saving informally, CDAs can ensure that their accumulated savings will be available when contingencies arise. These accumulated savings greatly influence, among other things, the probability of child health care use (Thind, 2004) and the timing and quality of health care sought (Deressa, Ali & Berhane). Accordingly, better health care advances children’s development and influences their adult health and economic status (Case, Fertig & Paxson, 2005).

Minimum initial deposits are a feature of CDAs offered by government-run savings banks, MFIs, and commercial banks. They range from US$0.50 at Rural Bank of Cantilan in the Philippines (Moore, 2005), to US$0.60 at Commercial Micro Finance Bank in Uganda (Kajoba, 2007), to US$4 at Akiba Commercial Bank in Tanzania (Akiba Commercial Bank, n.d.). CIMB Bank of Malaysia requires US$16 to open a CDA, versus an initial deposit of US$317 for a regular account (CIMB, n.d.). Other examples of low minimum initial deposits for CDAs include 100 Sri Lankan rupees (US$0.93) at Seylan Bank of Sri Lanka, and five Sri Lankan rupees (US$0.05) at National Savings Bank also of Sri Lanka (Seylan Bank, n.d.; National Savings Bank, n.d.)

7 There is a minimum opening deposit of five Sri Lankan rupees for National Savings Bank’s “Hapan” and “Punchi Hapan” accounts for minors (National Savings Bank, n.d.).
Modest in-kind and financial incentives. Modest in-kind and financial incentives are incentives used by institutions to encourage families to open accounts for their children, build their balances, and support a disciplined approach to savings. In Indonesia, for example, modest financial incentives increase the likelihood of opening a bank savings account (Cole, Sampson & Zia, 2009). Modest incentives may also improve a child well-being by providing supplementary educational materials to children and increasing the value of a family’s financial assets. Yet, perhaps a more important benefit of modest financial incentives is the potential to increase savings by motivating children, family members and relatives to save more.

Examples of in-kind incentives include: prizes, such as mugs and school bags, when an account balance reaches certain levels; entry into a raffle draw with prizes such as trips to amusement parks; and the gift of a piggy bank upon opening an account. Rural Bank of Cantilan in the Philippines awards locked “kiddie savers” piggy bank and school supplies to CDA accountholders (Moore, 2005). Institutions that are members of Sistema Fedecredito, a financial intermediary in El Salvador, provide offer discounts at bookstores and amusement parks to CDA accountholders (WSBI, personal correspondence, November 23, 2007).

Modest financial incentives can include higher interest rates compared with other savings products at the institution or in the market. They can also include bonus interest for periods during which accountholders do not withdraw funds. For example, Barclays Bank in Uganda offers their CDA accountholders double the usual interest award for those who make no withdrawal during a quarter (Barclays Bank, personal correspondence, December 18, 2007). BancoEstado, a public bank in Chile, offers a 10% bonus on the amount of interest earned in a year if no withdrawals are made “in the period” (WSBI, personal correspondence, December 3, 2007). Other FIs that offer premium interest rates on their CDAs include Mongolia’s Khan Bank and XacBank, Tanzania’s Akiba Commercial Bank, and Nigeria’s Sterling Bank. Meanwhile, Maybank in the Philippines gives free personal accident insurance for the child, parents/guardians, or designated co-insured party (Maybank, n.d.).

Another type of modest financial incentive offered by institutions to attract higher amounts of savings is a lottery with “monthly deadline.” This incentive works whereby an FI awards lottery tickets each month to children that save more than a minimum amount. The monthly deadline encourages a child to save regularly instead of postponing saving (Ashraf, Gons, Karlan & Yin, 2003). Cooperatives in Bolivia (Coop. de Ahorro y Credito Quillacollo, Coop. de Ahorro y Credito Abierta Trinidad), El Salvador (ACOPUS), Guatemala (Coop. de Ahorro y Credito Chorotega), Nicaragua (CACs Central Dinamica, Integral and Professional), and the Philippines (Panabo Multi-Purpose Cooperative) offer such an incentive (Ashraf, Gons, Karlan & Yin, 2003).

Significant financial incentives. Significant financial incentives, similar to modest financial incentives, directly increase financial resources. Yet significant financial incentives offered by CDAs create a substantial source of additional financial capital that may not be provided by modest incentives. As mentioned above, financial incentives can increase savings by providing rewards that motivate children, family members and relatives to save more. There is some evidence that significant financial incentives increase participation in saving programs, and even more evidence that these type of incentives, specifically matches, increase contributions (Moore, et. al., 2001; Duflo, Gale, Liebman, Orszag, & Saez, 2005; Sherraden, et. al, 2005). Increased contribution equals more savings that may be used to further enhance child development, from regular health service use to regular...
school attendance. In short, significant financial incentives have the potential to influence children’s development, albeit indirectly, since these incentives increase the amount of savings, which then allows family to afford better health care, education and nutrition for their children.

There are examples of CDAs from both governments and non-governmental institutions that offer accountholders significant financial incentives. In Senegal, for example, the “Sponsor a Child Project” of the National Agency for Little Children’s Homes enlists sponsors (called “godfathers” or “godmothers”) to make deposits on behalf of children. Under the government program, sponsors deposit 5,000 CFA (US$10.06) francs into a savings account upon a child’s birth. The consorters subsequently deposit 2,500 CFA francs (US$5.03) per month for six years. Once the child accountholders begin primary school, they are allowed to withdrawal 30,000 CFA francs (US$60.35) each year to support their education (Agence Nationale de la Case des Tout-Petits, 2007). In South Africa, the Association of Collective Investments, a private industry group, operates a CDA pilot program called Fundisa aimed at helping poor children save for higher education. The program offers bonuses of up to 25% of the money put into the investment accounts each year, with a cap of 600 rand (US$66.34) in bonus money. The Fundisa program requires that at least 40 rand (US$4.42) be deposited into the accounts each month. Money deposited into the accounts is invested in government bonds and bank deposits (Fundisa, n.d).

At the same time, some non-governmental institutions - including pilot research programs and NGOs - have the financial means to offer children account holders significant incentives for making deposits. For example, SEED/SUUBI, a matched savings experiment in Uganda, incorporates an example of a CDA that aims to help children enter adulthood with a stock of financial assets. Under the SEED/SUUBI program, children receive a 2:1 “match” on deposits, with a “match cap” of the equivalent of $10 a month per family. The program restricts use of the matched savings to specified purposes are post-primary education and micro-enterprise development. Children can withdraw their personal savings (but not the matching funds) from their account at any time, in case of emergency. (Ssewamala & Ismayilova, 2008). Meanwhile, World Vision Ethiopia, part of the Christian humanitarian non-profit World Vision International, expects to launch a savings program for vulnerable children in Ethiopia. The organization’s program plans to open savings accounts for participating children at an MFI and make yearly deposits into the accounts. The program plans to automatically transfer the equivalent of about US$15 each year into each child’s account. A premise of the program is if you grant money to young people over a number of years, they will treat it better and be a better steward than if the money is given to them in one lump sum. An advantage of the program, according to a World Vision International official, is that since the funds are deposited at a local MFI, they remain in the targeted communities. (World Vision International, personal correspondence, November 30, 2007; June 27, 2008)

Withdrawal restrictions. When coupled with financial incentives, withdrawal limitations reward children for taking a disciplined approach to savings. Although withdrawal restrictions may not directly influence a child’s development, this feature can mediate development by ensuring that savings will be available when desired contingency occurs. Most CDAs allow withdrawals to fund only expenses that are deemed beneficial to a child or his/her family. Withdrawal restrictions guarantee that there will be money available to pay for health or educational expenses. Alternatively, restrictions

---

8 The South African Department of Education is one of the sponsors of the bonus pool, along with several investment companies.
discourage family members against spending savings on expenditures that may be harmful or will not benefit the children or the family. Additionally, there is some evidence that a commitment savings product, which includes withdrawal restrictions, increases savings (Ashraf, Karlan & Yin, 2006). Higher savings translates to increased financial resources that may allow families to seek health care more promptly and/or send their children to school more regularly.

There are examples of governmental and non-governmental institutions in the developing world offering CDAs that restrict withdrawals. Jovenes con Oportunidades (Youth with Opportunities), the youth savings component of Oportunidades, the Mexican government’s principal anti-poverty program, restricts the withdrawal of funds from savings accounts until young accountholders graduate from Educación Media Superior (roughly equivalent to high school in the United States). This typically occurs at age 18. Jovenes con Oportunidades, launched by the Mexican government in 2003, opens savings accounts for children of poor families that already receive Oportunidades support in the child’s final year of Secundaria (roughly equivalent to middle school in the United States). The program is intended to incentivize continued education. Under the program, “points” are deposited into accounts for each year the student successfully completes of Educación Media Superior. Upon graduation, young people are allowed to convert the points into money, which is then available for withdrawal (Oportunidades, n.d.).

State-run banks, credit unions, and commercial banks also offer accounts that have withdrawal timing/usage restrictions. These are typically referred to as commitment savings plans. Khan Bank in Mongolia restricts withdrawals of its “Children’s Future Deposit” account before age 18 (while at the same time offering holders of this account “the highest deposit rate announced in that particular year”) (Khan Bank, n.d.). Zoos Bank of Mongolia also restricts withdrawals of its children’s “long-term” deposit accounts until accountholders turn 18 years old. (Zoos Bank, n.d.). SANASA of Aluthgama City, a primary society in Sri Lanka, has a more stringent restriction. The primary society only allows withdrawals before age 18 from the institution’s CDAs if children encounter bad health or if money is used to fund education (WOCCU, personal correspondence, November 16, 2007).

Child control of accounts. The ability of children to control their savings accounts (without a co-signer) can empower children and may give them a stronger sense of personal identity. It can also protect their account against misuse of the funds by family members or guardians. Aside from greater autonomy and stronger sense of identity, this CDA feature has the potential to contribute to

---

9 Oportunidades, which covers millions of the country’s rural residents, is a conditional cash transfer (CCT) program. This type of social assistance program provides cash to participants on the condition that they perform an action deemed beneficial to themselves and society.

10 A primary society is roughly equivalent to a credit union.

11 A study done by the India HIV/AIDS Alliance explored possible consequences of lack of access to savings accounts on orphaned street children. According to the study, orphaned street children may end up spending any excess money they earn from odd jobs on harmful items such as alcohol and drugs, because they don’t have access to banking services. In India, banking practices allow minors (those under 18 years old) to open joint bank accounts with their guardians, according to the study. As such, children have no access to banking services without guardians (a situation common among orphans). Thus, the study goes on to recommend that banks alter their rules in order to permit minors to open deposit accounts without a guardian as joint accountholder (India HIV/AIDS Alliance, 2007).
children’s educational development, specifically college expectation. There is some evidence in the U.S. that when financing of education, specifically college, is perceived to be under the child’s control, college attendance becomes a more plausible reality (Elliot III, 2008). Children with accounts are not only more likely to attend college but they also perform better in school (Elliot III, 2008).

The ability of a child to control his/her account can be seen in CDAs offered by at least a few types of institutions in the developing world. A prominent feature of CDAs offered as part of the SEED/SUUBI research project in Uganda are that they are held in the name of the children (Ssewamala & Ismayilova, 2008). BancoEstado in Chile allows girls to manage savings accounts at age 12 and boys to manage savings accounts at age 14 The differing ages are a factor of the bank’s definition of “pubescent minors” (WSBI, personal correspondence, December 3, 2007). ServiRed, a network of credit unions in Bolivia, has member institutions that prohibit parents from withdrawing savings from CDAs without the child’s consent (WOCCU, personal correspondence, November 30, 2007).

CDA delivery mechanisms

The standard delivery channel of CDAs is through brick-and-mortar bank branches. This channel has the benefit to the institution of not requiring an additional outlay of funds to conduct outreach to children. Instead, these channels can serve CDA accountholders alongside their other customers. Yet, institutions have made strides in expanding their reach through experimenting with alternative delivery channels. Alternative delivery mechanisms can benefit children by making it easier for parents to open accounts for their children, and enabling children to make regular deposits at locations more convenient to them than fixed branches. In short, delivery innovations can help CDA accountholders overcome a key barrier to savings: lack of physical access to bank branches. Delivery mechanisms (besides bank branches) include operating deposit centers at schools, and remote deposit collection. These delivery innovations and their potentials to contribute to children’s development are explored below.

Operating deposit centers at schools. Institutions can operate fixed deposit centers at schools where students can deposit money before classes, at lunch, or at other times. In many parts of the developing world, there are more schools than banks. Deposit centers at public schools offer institutions a great way to reach as many children and their families. Additionally, operating deposit centers at government schools can increase the likelihood that institutions reach children from families of diverse income levels (as opposed to those primarily from middle-class or well-off families).

---

14 Adopting certain alternative delivery mechanisms can be expensive. Yet, at the same time, banking via mobile phone and via “point-of-sale” (POS) terminals at retailers are examples of delivery mechanisms that have the potential to reduce (potentially drastically) the cost of delivering financial services. For an overview of branchless banking see Ivatury & Mas, 2008.

15 The field of behavioral economics can help explain the potential effectiveness of institutions making it easy for individuals to open an account. Behavioral economics draws insights from economics and psychology, can be thought of as the study of how people make choices. They generally operates with the premise that individuals don’t always make rational choices, and thus are potentially responsive to prompts that help them overcome barriers to making choices that in theory benefit them. For an overview of behavioral economics see Lambert, 2006. For a discussion of several “innovations” that stimulate savings and help people overcome barriers to savings see Tufano & Schneider, 2008).
At the same time, deposit centers at public schools may have the potential to contribute directly to a child’s educational development through the “learning by doing” experiences. Similar to school-based savings program in the United States, schools and FIs can integrate savings and other banking activities into the academic curriculum. Experiential learning in savings and banking may improve students’ knowledge of math and civic education, and develop their analytical skills. One noteworthy implication of this delivery innovation is its potential positive impact on the academic performance of poorer children, who overwhelmingly attends government schools. Additionally, deposit center activities that are integrated in the academic curriculum may help narrow the educational achievement gap, in many developing countries, between poor children in public schools and wealthier children in private schools.

Deposit centers at public schools may also have the potential to contribute indirectly to a child’s development by narrowing the disparity in access to CDAs between wealthier children in private schools and their less affluent peers in government schools. These deposit centers offer children attending public schools and their families a formal way to save, instead of saving in a jar or under the mattress. They also allow students to make regular deposits in a convenient, less-costly way. Many of them only have access to CDAs through deposit centers in their schools. They provide young students a protected place for their savings, which will be available when they need money to pay for school or their other needs. In short, deposit centers may act as mediators between guaranteed financial resources, in the form of savings, and children’s educational progress, among other things. Alternatively, absence of deposit centers may leave students without access to CDAs; lack of option to save formally; and no savings to pay for expenses that are essential to their development.

Both state-run banks and commercial FIs operate deposit centers in schools in the developing world. Thailand’s Government Savings Bank operates a school-based banking program, where banking centers in schools are operated by students who receive training in bookkeeping from bank employees, and supported by teachers and bank staff. The bank’s school-based banking centers offer both deposit and withdrawal services. Students deposit money with the school bank; the school, in turn, opens one account with the bank (Government Savings Bank, n.d.). As of December 2007, Government Savings Bank of Thailand operated 216 school banks (Government Savings Bank, n.d.). Another example of a program offering banking in schools is Sanchayika, the school savings bank program of the National Savings Institute of India (WSBI, 2007). Meanwhile, Hatton National Bank of Sri Lanka operates 150 school banking units (Microfinance Gateway, n.d.).

Remote deposit collection. Under this outreach, officials from FIs use motorbikes, motor vehicles, and other modes of transport to periodically visit schools and other designated deposit centers in the community to collect deposits. Although mobile bankers may not directly result to an improved child well being, employing them has the potential to reach a greater number of children and their families whom otherwise would not have access to savings accounts or difficulty making regular deposits. Another way mobile bankers may impact child development indirectly is through lowering costs for saving and allowing children and their families to make regular deposits. This can be the case because accountholders do not need to use time and pay transportation costs to visit bank branches. Lower saving costs may allow families to allocate the extra resources, which would have been used to pay for bank visits, to other expenditures that may improve their children’s well being, or to increase their savings. In the Philippines, for example, deposit collection services have been shown to increase savings (Ashraf, Karlan & Yin, 2005). The savings increase can be linked to the
regular visits by deposit collectors. These visits may allow accountholders to accumulate higher savings because deposit collectors act as a daily reminder and pressure to save (Ashraf, et. al., 2003).

There are examples of MFIs, credit cooperatives, and commercial banks that employ remote deposit collection. PNG Microfinance of Papua New Guinea sends employees from its branches into schools in the vicinity of the branches to collect deposits (PNG Microfinance, personal correspondence, November 20, 2007). ANZ of Australia sends out a vehicle to travel on a set route around Samoa’s most-populous island, Upolu, four days a week visiting different schools and also serving the school communities (ANZ, personal correspondence, December 7, 2007). Also, at least a few cooperatives employ deposit collectors to collect deposits from clients, including children.16 These cooperatives include: Iaguei Credit Union in Nicaragua, Panabo Multi-Purpose Cooperative in the Philippines, and SANASA Thrift and Credit Cooperative Societies in Sri Lanka (Ashraf, et. al., 2003).

Implications of CDAs in Developing Countries

The previous section presented an overview of some features and delivery mechanisms of CDAs in developing countries. Clearly, the CDA experience in the developing world is varied and distinct from the traditional CDA policy experience in developed countries. This final section considers a few implications of this analysis for social policymakers and researchers.

Data on the reach of CDAs

CDA products can be designed to reach large populations. While data are limited, the extent of CDA uptake at least a few institutions in the developing world illustrates that CDAs have the potential to be offered and adopted on a wider scale. Numerous institutions, particularly financial institutions, have proven quite creative at designing and delivering CDAs that effectively reach large populations of children, most of them poor and/or unbanked. At Thailand’s Government Savings Bank, “the number of school-based banks reached 169 and opened 475,855 accounts as of August 2006. (WSBI, 2007). To date, Bank Simpanan Nasional has 1,566 schools under its “Adoptive School Program” and 30,000 members in the Young Savers Club (WSBI, 2007). PostBank Uganda’s Early Start Savings Program, which initially started with schoolchildren from Kampala, has expanded, with just one year of operations, to 25 schools served by five of its branches (WSBI, 2007). The “Future Millionaire” savings account of Mongolia’s XacBank reaches more than 62,000 children, representing 22% of the bank’s total deposits and 34% of the bank’s accountholders as of the end of 2007 (XacBank, n.d.).17 By offering accounts at schools and hospitals, Hatton Bank in Sri Lanka recently held more than 400,000 CDAs, with a balance of over US$35 million as of June 2007 (Microfinance Gateway, n.d.).18 BancoEstado in Chile holds over 750,000 CDAs, accounting for over 15% of the country’s population of children (WSBI, personal correspondence, December 3, 2007).

---

16 Deposit collectors are generally bank employees or contract workers that go door-to-door collecting deposits from individuals. This allows clients to make relatively frequent, small deposits. For more information about deposit collectors, see Ashraf et. al, 2003.

17 Future Millionaire accounts restrict withdrawals until age 18 and require a minimum balance of 3000 Mongolian Turgiks (US$2.63) (XacBank, n.d.).

18 For the sake of comparison, as of June 2007, Hatton National Bank had a total of US$591 million in all regular savings accounts (Microfinance Gateway, n.d.).
Learning from CDA experience

Policymakers can learn from current CDA experiences in the developing world. In developing countries, governments offer the most potential to ensure universal (and potentially progressive) access to CDAs, particularly those with significant financial incentives intended to spur asset accumulation. In South Africa, for example, the Fundisa program is a partnership between the public and private sectors. However, many obstacles prevent the creation of such ambitious policies in developing countries. These include lack of resources (fiscal or human) to create, fund, and manage large-scale social investment programs; lack of widespread access to financial services (making provision of accounts to all children highly problematic); and lack of political will for a relatively expensive yet largely untested social program (which affects the ability to generate political will and budgetary resources).

Nonetheless, our study reveals that diverse institutions have proven capable of successfully offering creatively-designed and targeted CDAs to children throughout developing countries. These experiences with successful CDA products and programs have the potential to (a) serve as a platform for more comprehensive CDA policies and (b) provide lessons to policymakers about design options for CDAs that are lower-cost and higher-impact. Indeed, the growing interest of developing country policymakers in social investment programs, and the commitment of these countries to expanding access to financial services for the poor may help lay the groundwork for the introduction of CDA pilot programs, and ultimately, CDA policies in the developing world context.

For example, social investment programs such as conditional cash transfer (CCT) programs, are proliferating around the world. More than 40 countries, developed and developing, have now implemented or are testing CCT programs. These programs, which provide a cash transfer to beneficiaries on the condition that they fulfill certain obligations, could easily be linked with CDAs. While there is only one case of a CCT-CDA linkage to date (the “Jovenes Con Oportunidades” program of Oportunidades), there is increasing interest in link CCTs with saving products. At the same time, there is increasing evidence that more and more governments are taking a more active role in ensuring universal, effective access to financial services in their countries. Over 30 countries, most of them in Africa, have produced National Microfinance Strategies (Duflos & Glisovic-Mezieres, 2008). In addition, a number of countries, such as India, Kenya, Pakistan, and South Africa, have gone as far as to develop country-wide financial inclusion strategies that either promote or mandate broad-based financial inclusion.

Final thoughts

There are reasons to believe that more governmental and non-governmental institutions in the developing world will begin offering CDAs. First, policymakers and development practitioners have placed increasing attention in recent years on meeting the demand for financial services, including savings services, from those of modest means in the developing world. Second, the proliferation of MFIs over the past several years; the resurgence of proximity banks; and the growing interest of researchers in finding ways to prioritize and increase access to savings products for the poor also illustrate this trend. Finally, advances in technology, especially related to banking through mobile phones and through “point-of-sale” (POS) terminals in retailers (such as pharmacies), offer a particularly promising way to reduce costs to institutions of offering savings services, and thus increase provision of these services.
References


### Table 1. Africa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Program or Product</th>
<th>Fundisa&lt;sup&gt;19&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>SEED/SUUBI Project&lt;sup&gt;20&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Early Start Savings Account (PostBank Uganda Limited)&lt;sup&gt;21&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Zawadi Account (Akiba Commercial Bank Limited)&lt;sup&gt;23&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>Rakai District, Uganda</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Institution</td>
<td>National Government&lt;sup&gt;24&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Non-governmental institution (academic organizations)</td>
<td>State-owned financial institution</td>
<td>Commercial financial institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>To save for children’s college or university education.</td>
<td>To promote economic empowerment among families caring for orphaned and vulnerable children.&lt;sup&gt;25&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>To instill saving culture among children and encourage parents to save for a rainy day.</td>
<td>To instill saving culture among children and encourage parents to save for their education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Enrollment (Automatic or Facilitated)</td>
<td>Facilitated&lt;sup&gt;26&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Automatic</td>
<td>Facilitated</td>
<td>Facilitated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Parents open Fundisa accounts in participating financial institutions.</td>
<td>• CDAs are automatically opened for children in the experimental group.</td>
<td>• Parents or guardian can open an account on behalf of their children.</td>
<td>• Parents or guardian can open an account on behalf of their children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Population</td>
<td>Low-income children and families</td>
<td>Orphaned and vulnerable children and their caretakers</td>
<td>Children 18 years old and below</td>
<td>Children 18 years old and below</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<sup>24</sup> Partnership between the Department of Education and the private sector.

<sup>25</sup> Specifically, the intervention promotes children’s savings accounts, also known as Children’s Development Accounts (CDAs), specifically for postprimary education for orphaned and vulnerable children and microenterprise development (e.g., small income-generating businesses) for families caring for these children in Uganda (Ssewemala & Ismayilova, 2008).

<sup>26</sup> Fundisa accounts can be opened in any participating branches of Absa Bank, NedBank or Standard Bank.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Program or Product</th>
<th>Fundisa(^1)</th>
<th>SEED/SUUBI Project(^2)</th>
<th>Early Start Savings Account (PostBank Uganda Limited)(^3)</th>
<th>Zawadi Account (Akiba Commercial Bank Limited)(^4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attempts at Universal or Widespread Coverage</td>
<td>Yes, any South African citizen or permanent resident can open a Fundisa account, as long as the beneficiary is South African.</td>
<td>Pilot project. Total of 386 children were involved in the SEED/SUUBI study.</td>
<td>Yes, the program started initially with schoolchildren from Kampala. After one year of operations, the bank serves 25 schools through 5 of its branches.</td>
<td>Yes, the bank offers the Zawadi account in all of its branches all over the country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentives Used</td>
<td>Financial incentive of up to 25 percent of the money saved each year.</td>
<td>Matching incentive of up to US$10 a month per family. Match rate is 2:1.</td>
<td>Gifts</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Key Features</td>
<td>● Low minimum monthly deposit (40 rand or US$4). ● Only the first 2400 rand (US$268) qualify for the bonus.</td>
<td>● Matching funds are kept in a separate account. ● Restricted use of the matched saving, i.e. for education or small business.</td>
<td>● The account is free of charge. ● Low initial deposit requirement</td>
<td>● Higher savings interest rate than normal savings accounts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Asia and the Pacific

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Type of Institution</th>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Type of Enrollment (Automatic or Facilitated)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Butterflies/Children’s Development Bank (CDB) | South Asia         | Non-governmental institution (NGO) | To equip street and working children to access education and health care. | Facilitated  
- Although any child can save money with the bank, the child has to approach any CDB locations to open an account. |
| Student Saver’s Club (Cantilan Bank) | Surigao del Sur, Philippines | Non-governmental institution (rural bank) | To teach local children about the value of savings, and to court “savers for life”—potentially high-value future clients. | Facilitated  
- An account coordinator from the bank travels from classroom to classroom to open accounts. |
| Government Savings Bank | Thailand | State-owned financial institution | To promote savings habits among children. | Facilitated  
- Students make an initial deposit to open a savings account. |
| Singithi Kirikatiyo (Hatton National Bank) | Sri Lanka | Commercial bank | To inculcate savings habits among children and offer parents opportunity to save for their kids. | Mixed  
- Parents of newborn babies will be given a “Singithi Kirikatiyo” voucher at the birth of the child. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target Population</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Butterflies/Children’s Development Bank (CDB) | Street and working children from age 9 to 18. | To equip street and working children to access education and health care. | Facilitated  
- Although any child can save money with the bank, the child has to approach any CDB locations to open an account. |
| Student Saver’s Club (Cantilan Bank) | Children from rural areas, age 7-16 years. | To teach local children about the value of savings, and to court “savers for life”—potentially high-value future clients. | Facilitated  
- An account coordinator from the bank travels from classroom to classroom to open accounts. |
| Government Savings Bank | Schoolchildren | To promote savings habits among children. | Facilitated  
- Students make an initial deposit to open a savings account. |
| Singithi Kirikatiyo (Hatton National Bank) | Babies born in hospitals | To inculcate savings habits among children and offer parents opportunity to save for their kids. | Mixed  
- Parents of newborn babies will be given a “Singithi Kirikatiyo” voucher at the birth of the child. |

---

31 Children’s Development Bank objectives also include: 1) to organize children for collective action for self empowerment; 2) to provide facilities for skill acquisition and vocational training; 3) to provide skills and support to initiate and manage small businesses; 4) to enhance self esteem and confidence of children and adolescents; and 5) to work in partnership with local government and other organizations concerned with children, civil society, media, financial institutions and local entrepreneurs (Children’s Development Bank, n.d.).
To provide technical assistance to other children’s groups in India and abroad to set up their own Children’s Development Banks.
32 The voucher must be used to open an account within a period of 3 months after the birth of the child.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Attempts at Universal or Widespread Coverage</th>
<th>Incentives Used</th>
<th>Other Key Features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Butterflies/Children’s Development Bank (CDB)⁰⁷      | Yes, CDB now offers these accounts in several Indian cities as well as in Afghanistan, Bangladesh and Nepal. | None                                                | • Children manage the bank and their accounts.  
• An interest of 50% is provided for savers who do not withdraw savings for six months.                                                                                                                           |
| Student Saver’s Club (Cantilan Bank)⁰⁸               | Yes, attempt to cover public and private schools within the bank’s coverage area. | Gifts (mainly school supplies) and free swimming clinics | • Low initial deposit (50 cents).  
• The program is a school-based banking scheme that offers savings deposit service.  
• The school-based banks are operated by students while the bank provides advisory roles.  
• Promote savings from birth.  
• Higher interest rate (3 percent above the normal savings interest rate).  
• Gifts for each birthday (up to age 5). |
<p>| Government Savings Bank⁰⁹                             | Currently, there are 169 school-based banks all over Thailand and more than 475,000 accounts opened. The saving accounts are offered school-wide. | Scholarships, school materials and study tours.     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Singithi Kirikatiyo (Hatton National Bank)¹⁰         | Yes, the bank plans to offer the savings product island wide and include all key hospitals and nurseries. | Gifts and match initial deposit. (When parents make an initial deposit of 1,000 rupee, the bank matches the initial deposit.) |                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Oportunidades Savings Component (account are opened with BANSEFI)(^{33})</th>
<th>Cuentamiga (Caja Popular Mexicana)(^{34})</th>
<th>Ahorro Niño (Banco Estado)(^{35})</th>
<th>Super Ahorro Programado Infantil (Santander Banefe)(^{36})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>Chile (urban areas)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Institution</td>
<td>National government</td>
<td>Non-governmental institution (Credit union)</td>
<td>State-owned financial institution</td>
<td>Commercial financial institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>To combat poverty</td>
<td>To instill savings habit among children.</td>
<td>To inculcate savings habit among children.</td>
<td>To instill savings habit among children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Enrollment (Automatic or Facilitated)</td>
<td>Automatic● Beneficiaries receive US$336 in a savings account upon completion of high school (12(^{th}) grade).</td>
<td>Facilitated● Parents or guardian can open an account on behalf of their children.</td>
<td>Facilitated● Parents or guardian can open an account on behalf of their children.</td>
<td>Facilitated● Parents and/or guardian can open the accounts in any bank location.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attempts at Universal or Widespread Coverage</td>
<td>Yes, the program covers 5 million households.</td>
<td>Yes, cuentamiga can be accessed in all 330 branches.</td>
<td>Yes, ahorro niño is available in all branches of Banco Estado.</td>
<td>Yes, the savings product is available in all bank branches in Chile.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentives Used</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Free ATM card specifically designed for younger clients.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Key Features</td>
<td>● Part of a larger cash transfer program● Withdrawal restriction</td>
<td>● Low initial deposit</td>
<td>● Account is free.● 10% interest if no annual withdrawal.● Child ownership of accounts</td>
<td>● Account is free.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>